

## ERROR EXPANSION FOR FEM AND SUPERCONVERGENCE UNDER NATURAL ASSUMPTION\*

Lin Qun Xie Rui-feng

(Institute of Systems Science, Academia Sinica, Beijing, China)

In this paper, we derive the error expansion for finite element method under natural assumption and discuss the superconvergence as a special case of error expansion.

### §1. Introduction

In a survey by Krizek and Neittaanmaki various types of superconvergence for FEM were discussed at some cases. But we can not expect the superconvergence for the displacement of linear finite element solution. At that case we can raise the convergence accuracy considerably using Richardson extrapolation. On extrapolation for FEM Chinese - German group has obtained a lot of results under some assumptions. See a survey by Rannacher. In this paper, we try to unit the discussion of superconvergence with the one of extrapolation. We deduce the error expansion under natural assumptions and discuss the superconvergence as a special case of error expansion. Consider the model problem

$$-\Delta u = f \text{ in } \Omega, \quad u = 0 \quad \text{on } \partial\Omega \quad (1.1)$$

where  $\Omega \subset R^2$  is a convex domain and has smooth or piecewise smooth boundary. We use the finite element space over piecewise uniform or piecewise almost uniform triangulation to construct the finite element solution of problem (1.1). Let  $u^h$  and  $u^I$  be the linear finite element solution and interpolation of the true solution respectively. We derive the following expansion

$$u^h - u^I = \sum_{K=1}^{n-1} h^{2K} e_K^h + r^h \quad (1.2)$$

where the coefficients  $e_K^h$  are the finite element projections of the weak solution of problem (1.1) with different right hand side, and the remainder  $r^h$  satisfies

$$\|r^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq c |\ln h| h^{\alpha_n}$$

where  $\alpha_n$  depends on the situation and  $\Omega_0$  is the subdomain of  $\Omega$  which we shall describe in details.

\*Received November 30, 1987.

As a special case with  $n = 1$  we have the superconvergence estimate

$$\|u^h - u^I\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq ch^{\alpha_1} |\ln h|.$$

Replacing  $\nabla u^h$  by some kind of average gradient  $\bar{\nabla} u^h$  we obtain

$$(\bar{\nabla} u^h - \nabla u)(p) = O(h^{\alpha_1} |\ln h|)$$

for any nodal point  $p$  in  $\Omega_0$ .

With  $n = 2$  in (1.2) we get

$$u^h - u^I = h^2 w^I + r^h \tag{1.3}$$

from which we have

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{3}(4u^{h/2} - u^h)(p) - u(p) &= O(h^{\alpha_2} |\ln h|), \\ \frac{1}{3}\bar{\nabla}(4u^{h/2} - u^h)(p) - \nabla u(p) &= O(h^{\alpha_2} |\ln h|). \end{aligned} \tag{1.4}$$

For the proof of (1.3) we emphasize the situation when  $\Omega$  is a polygonal domain and  $u$  is of usual smoothness. At that case  $\alpha_2 = 2\bar{\beta} - \varepsilon$  where  $\varepsilon$  is any positive number and  $\bar{\beta}$  depends on the interior angle of  $\Omega$ . In the last section we prove (1.4) with  $\alpha_2 = 4$  when  $\Omega$  is a smooth domain.

## §2. Error Expansion on a Convex Polygonal Domain

Let  $\Omega \subset R^2$  be a convex polygonal domain with the corner points  $\{o_j\}$ . We consider the problem (1.1) and its finite element solution. Choosing an arbitrary point  $o$  in  $\bar{\Omega}$  and linking  $o$  with each corner point  $o_j$ , we subdivide  $\Omega$  into several macro-triangles  $\{\Omega_j\}$  with edges  $\Gamma_j = \bar{o}o_j$ . Let  $T_h = \{K\}$  be a regular triangulation of  $\Omega$ . Suppose that the restriction  $T_j$  to each  $\Omega_j$  of  $T_h$  is uniform, i.e. each side of each triangle in  $T_j$  is parallel to one of three fixed direction vector. Assume that  $S_h \subset H_0^1$  is the standard piecewise linear finite element space and  $u^h$  is the finite element solution. In order to evaluate the error expansion we consider the integral

$$\begin{aligned} I(u, v) &= \int_{\Omega} \nabla(u^h - u^I) \nabla v dx = \int_{\Omega} \nabla(u - u^I) \nabla v dx \\ &= \sum_j \int_{\Omega_j} \nabla(u - u^I) \nabla v dx, \quad \forall v \in S^h. \end{aligned} \tag{2.1}$$

It suffices to expand the integral

$$\int_{\Omega_j} \nabla(u - u^I) \nabla v dx.$$

For uniform triangulation  $T_j$  we introduce the standard notation as in [2]:  $s_i, p_i, n_i, t_i, h_i, A, \partial_i, D_i$ . Our discussion is based on the following Euler-Maclaurin formula:

$$\int_{s_i} (u - u^I) ds = \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} \beta_k h_i^{2k} \int_{s_i} D_i^{2k} u ds + h_i^{2n} \int_{s_i} \beta_n(s) D_i^{2n} u ds \tag{2.2}$$

where  $\beta_n(s) \in C_0^1(s_i)$  and  $\beta_n(s)$  can be extended to a function  $B_i \in C(\bar{\Omega})$  such that

$$B_i|_{s_i}(s) = \beta_n(s), \quad D_{i+2} B_i = 0, \quad B_i|_{s_{i+2}} = 0.$$

By the argument used in [2], we derive

$$\begin{aligned} \int_{\Omega} \nabla(u - u^I) \nabla v dx &= \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} h^{2k} \sum_j \left( \int_{\Omega_j} L_j^{2k+1} u v dx + \int_{\Gamma_j} L_j^{2k+1} u v ds \right) \\ &+ \sum_{n=1}^{n-1} h^{2k} L_0^{2k} u(0) v(0) + h^{2n} \sum_{i,j} c_{ji} \int_{\Omega_j} B_{ji} D_{i+2} D_i^{2n} u D_{i+1} v dx \\ &+ h^{2n} \sum_j \int_{\Gamma_j} \beta_n(s) L_j^{2n} u \partial_\tau v ds \end{aligned} \tag{2.3}$$

where  $L_j^m$  are some differential operators of order  $m, c_{ji}$  are some constant independent of  $h, B_{ji}$  are the function  $B_i$  defined on  $\Omega_j$  and  $\partial_\tau$  denotes the tangent derivative along  $\Gamma_j$ .

Letting  $e_k \in H_0^1, r_n^h \in S_h, z_j^h \in S_h$  such that

$$\begin{aligned} (\nabla e_k, \nabla \varphi) &= I_k(\varphi) && \text{for } \varphi \in H_0^1, \\ (\nabla r_n^h, \nabla v) &= I_n(v) && \text{for } v \in S^h, \\ (\nabla z_j^h, \nabla v) &= F_j(v) && \text{for } v \in S^h, \end{aligned}$$

we may write

$$u^h - u^I = \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} h^{2k} (e_k^h + c_k G^h) + h^{2n} (r_n^h + \sum_j z_j^h) \tag{2.4}$$

where  $G$  is the Green function with singular point at 0. In order to estimate the remainder we need the regularized Green function  $g_z$  in [2]. With any fixed directional derivative  $\partial$  we can write

$$\partial r_n^h(z) = (\nabla r_n^h, \nabla g_z^h) = I_n(g_z^h) = \sum_{i,j} c_{ji} \int_{\Omega_j} B_{ji} D_{i+2} D_i^{2n} u D_{i+1} g_z^h dx,$$

$$|\partial r_n^h(z)| \leq c \|u\|_{2n+1, \infty} \|g_z^h\|_{1,1} \leq c |\ln h| \|u\|_{2n+1, \infty},$$

$$\|r_n^h\|_{1, \infty} \leq c |\ln h| \|u\|_{2n+1, \infty}.$$

To estimate  $z_j^h$  we write

$$\beta_n(s) = \beta_n + h_i^2 \beta_{n+1}''(s), \quad \forall s \in s_i$$

with  $\beta_{n+1}'(s) \in C_0^1(s_i)$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned} \partial z_j^h(z) &= F_j(g_z^h) = \int_{\Gamma_j} \beta_n(s) L_j^{2n} u \partial_\tau g_z^h ds \\ &= \beta_n \int_{\Gamma_j} L_j^{2n} u \partial_\tau g_z^h ds - h_i^2 \int_{\Gamma_j} \beta_{n+1}'(s) \partial_\tau L_j^{2n} u \partial_\tau g_z^h ds \\ &= -\beta_n \int_{\Gamma_j} \partial_\tau L_j^{2n} u g_z^h ds - h_i^2 \int_{\Gamma_j} \beta_{n+1}'(s) \partial_\tau L_j^{2n} u \partial_\tau g_z^h ds + \beta_n L_j^{2n} u(0) g_z^h(0), \end{aligned}$$

$$|\nabla z_j^h(z)| \leq c \|u\|_{2n+1,\infty} \left( \int_{\Gamma_j} |g_z^h| ds + h \int_{\Gamma_j} |\nabla g_z^h| ds + |g_z^h(0)| \right),$$

$$|\nabla z_j^h(z)| \leq c \|u\|_{2n+1,\infty} \left( \int_{\Omega} |\nabla g_z^h| dx + |g_z^h(0)| \right) \leq c \|u\|_{2n+1,\infty} (|\ln h| + |g_z^h(0)|).$$

For a fixed domain  $\Omega_o$  such that  $\Omega_o$  doesn't contain 0, we have

$$\|z_j^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_o} \leq c |\ln h| \|u\|_{2n+1,\infty}.$$

Hence, we can write (2.4) as

$$u^h - u^I = \sum_{k=1}^{n-1} h^{2k} (e_k^h + c_k G^h) + \tilde{r}_n \tag{2.5}$$

with  $\tilde{r}_n$  satisfying

$$\|\tilde{r}_n\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_o} \leq ch^{2n} |\ln h|.$$

Taking  $n = 1$  we have the superconvergence estimate

$$\|u^h - u^I\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_o} \leq ch^2 |\ln h|. \tag{2.6}$$

For any interior node  $p$ , there are two opposite elements  $K$  and  $K'$  with  $p$  as their common vertice. We define  $\bar{\nabla}$  by

$$\bar{\nabla} v(p) = \frac{1}{2} (\nabla v|_K + \nabla v|_{K'}), \quad v \in S_h.$$

Then we have in [3]

$$\begin{aligned} \|(\bar{\nabla} u^I - \nabla u)(p)\| &\leq ch^2 \|u\|_{3,\infty,K \cup K'}, \\ (\bar{\nabla} u^I - \nabla u)(p) &= h^2 \bar{e}(p) + O(h^4) \|u\|_{5,\infty,K \cup K'} \end{aligned} \tag{2.7}$$

with some function  $\bar{e}$  independent of  $h$ .

Now we have the superconvergent approximation to the true solution:

$$|(\bar{\nabla} u^h - \nabla u)(p)| \leq ch^2 |\ln h|.$$

By the localization method (cf. Wahlin), for  $\Omega_1 \subset \Omega$  such that  $\Omega_o \subset \Omega_1$  and  $(\partial\Omega_1 \setminus \partial\Omega) \cup \partial\Omega_o = \phi$ , we have

$$\|u^h - u^I\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_o} \leq ch^2 |\ln h| \|u\|_{3,\infty,\Omega_o} + \|u - u^h\|_{-2,2,\Omega_1}. \tag{2.8}$$

Taking  $n = 2$  in (2.5),

$$u^h - u^I = h^2(e_1^h + c_1 G^h) + \tilde{r}_2.$$

We assume  $\tilde{\Omega}_o$  doesn't contain the corner point of  $\Omega$  in addition. Because  $e_1$  and  $G$  are smooth in the neighborhood of  $\Omega_o$ , an application of (2.8) gives

$$\|e_1^h - e_1^I\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_o} \leq ch^2 |\ln h|;$$

$$\|G^I - G^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_o} \leq ch^2 |\ln h|.$$

We obtain

$$u^h - u^I = h^2(e_1^I + c_1 G^I) + R^h$$

with

$$\|R^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_o} \leq ch^4 |\ln h|.$$

From the above expansion and (2.7) we have

$$(u^h - u)(p) = h^2(e_1 + c_1 G)(p) + O(h^4 |\ln h|),$$

$$(\nabla u^h - \nabla u)(p) = h^2(\nabla e_1 + c_1 \nabla G + \tilde{e})(p) + O(h^4 |\ln h|).$$

### §3. Local Analysis of Error Expansion on a Piecewise Uniform Mesh With Less Smooth Solution

In section 2 we obtained the error expansion and derived superconvergence as special case when the solution  $u$  is very smooth globally on  $\tilde{\Omega}$ . But the solution is not so smooth usually even if the right hand side  $f$  of the problem (1.1) is analytic on  $\tilde{\Omega}$ . In this section, we investigate the error expansion provided only that  $f$  is sufficiently smooth. As in section 2, we let  $\{o_j\}$  denote the corner points of  $\Omega$ . Denotes the maximal interior angle of  $\Omega$  by  $\tilde{\alpha}$ . Set  $\tilde{\beta} = \pi/\tilde{\alpha}$ . Without loss of generality, we assume  $\tilde{\beta} \leq 2$ . Let  $d(x) = \prod_j |x - o_j|$ . For any real  $\alpha$  and integer  $k$  define the space

$$H_\alpha^k = \{u/d^{\alpha+|\beta|} \partial^\beta u \in L^2 \quad \text{for any } |\beta| \leq k\}$$

with the norm

$$\|u\|_{k,\alpha,\Omega} = \left( \sum_{|\beta| \leq k} \int_\Omega d^{2\alpha+2|\beta|} |\partial^\beta u|^2 dx \right)^{\frac{1}{2}}.$$

It is known that

$$f \in H_\alpha^{k-2} \text{ implies } u \in H_\alpha^k \text{ for } \alpha > -1 - \bar{\beta} \text{ and } k \geq 2.$$

We also use the piecewise uniform triangulation described in §2 to construct the finite element solution. Using the standard analysis for the interpolation function, we can prove

$$\|u - u^I\|_{1,\alpha,\Omega} \leq ch^{\alpha-\beta} \|u\|_{2,\beta,\Omega}$$

for  $\alpha - 1 \leq \beta < \alpha$ .

Let  $u \in H_\alpha^2 \cap C^3(\Omega)$  for some  $\alpha$ . In order to apply the local estimate (2.8), we need to estimate  $\|u - u^h\|_{-1,2}$ . Using dual argument we have

$$\|u - u^h\|_{-1,2} \leq ch^{1+2/q-2/q_0} |u - u^I|_{1,p}$$

provided  $1 \leq p \leq 2, q = \frac{p}{p-1}$  and  $q_0 \leq \min(q, \frac{2}{2-\bar{\beta}})$ . Taking  $p, r$  such that  $r - 1 \leq \alpha < r < \frac{2}{p} - 2$ , we have

$$|u - u^I|_{1,p} \leq \|u - u^I\|_{1,r} \leq ch^{r-2} \|u\|_{2,\alpha}$$

Then choosing the numbers  $p, r, q_0$  appropriately, we can obtain

$$\|u - u^h\|_{-1,2} \leq ch^{\bar{\beta}-\alpha-1-\epsilon} \|u\|_{2,\alpha}$$

with  $\bar{\beta} - 3 < \alpha < 0$  and  $\epsilon > 0$ . Inserting the above inequality in (2.8) we derive

$$\|u^I - u^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq ch^{\bar{\beta}-\alpha-1-\epsilon} \|u\|_{2,\alpha} + ch^2 |\ln h| \|u\|_{3,\infty,\Omega_1} \tag{3.1}$$

with  $\bar{\beta} - 3 < \alpha < 0, \epsilon > 0$  and  $u \in H_\alpha^2 \cap C^3(\tilde{\Omega}_1)$ .

Now we come to discuss the error expansion. Assume that  $\Omega_0$  is a fixed subdomain of  $\Omega$  such that  $\tilde{\Omega}_0$  doesn't contain 0 or any corner point of  $\Omega$ . Let  $\Omega_0 \subset D_1 \subset D_2 \subset \Omega$  satisfy that  $0 \in D_1, D_2$  doesn't contain any corner point of  $\Omega, (\partial D_2 \setminus \partial \Omega) \cup \bar{D}_1 = \phi$  and  $(\partial D_1 \setminus \partial \Omega_0) \cap \tilde{\Omega}_0 = \phi$ . Choose function  $\varphi \in C^\infty(\tilde{\Omega})$  such that  $\varphi|_{D_1} = 1$  and  $\varphi|_{\Omega \setminus D_2} = 0$ . Suppose  $f$  is sufficiently smooth. From the properties of the solution of elliptic problem on a polygonal domain,  $u \in C^6(\Omega) \cap H_\alpha^5$  for  $\alpha > -1 - \bar{\beta}$ . Set  $u_1 = \varphi u$  and  $u_2 = u - u_1$ . Then  $u_1 \in C^5(\tilde{\Omega})$ . Using the results derived in section 2, we have the expansion for  $u_1$ :

$$u_1^h - u_1^I = h^2 w^I + r^h, \quad \|r^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq ch^4 |\ln h|.$$

For  $u_2$  we use the error expansion (2.4):

$$u_2^h - u_2^I = h^2 (e_1^h + c_1 G^h) + h^4 (r_2^h + \sum_j z_j^h)$$

with  $e_1, r_2^h, z_j^h$  such that

$$(\nabla e_1, \nabla \varphi) = \sum_j \left( \int_{\Omega_j} L_j^4 u_2 \varphi dx + \int_{\Gamma_j} L_j^3 u_2 \varphi ds \right) \quad \text{for } \varphi \in C_0^\infty(\Omega),$$

$$(\nabla r_2^h, \nabla v) = \sum_{i,j} c_{ji} \int_{\Omega_j} B_{ji} D_{i+2} D_i^4 u_2 D_{i+1} v dx \quad \text{for } v \in S^h,$$

$$(\nabla z_j^h, \nabla v) = \int_{\Gamma_j} \beta_n(S) L_j^4 u_2 \partial_r v ds \quad \text{for } v \in S^h.$$

As smooth case in section 2, we have

$$\|G^h - G^I\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq ch^2 |\ln h|.$$

Because  $u \in C^6(\Omega) \cap H_\alpha^5$  for  $\alpha > -1 - \bar{\beta}$ , we can prove  $e_1 \in C^3(\Omega) \cap H_\alpha^3 \subset C^3(\Omega) \cap H_\alpha^2$  for  $\alpha > 1 - \bar{\beta}$ . An application of (3.1) gives

$$\|e_1^h - e_1^I\|_{1,\infty} \leq ch^{2\bar{\beta}-2-\epsilon}.$$

In order to estimate the remainders we need some properties for the regularized Green function  $g_z$ . By the argument used by Blum and Rannacher, we have

$$\|g_z\|_{1,\alpha,\Omega \setminus D_1} \leq \|g_z\|_{2,\alpha,\Omega \setminus D_1} \leq c, \quad \text{for } z \in \Omega_0, \alpha > -\bar{\beta} - 1;$$

$$\|g_z - g_z^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega \setminus D_1} \leq ch^{\bar{\beta}-1-\epsilon} \quad \text{for } z \in \Omega_0 \quad \text{and } \epsilon > 0.$$

Because  $B_{ji}$  come from  $\beta_2(s)$  which satisfies that  $\beta_2(s) \in C_0^1(s_i)$ ,  $\beta_2'(s) \in C_0^1(s_i)$  and  $|D^k \beta_2(s)| \leq ch^{-k}$  for  $k = 0, 1, 2, \dots$ , we have

$$|B_{ji}(x)| \leq ch^{-\alpha} d^\alpha \quad \text{for } 0 \leq \alpha \leq 2.$$

Noting that  $u_2$  vanishes on  $D_1$ , we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} |\partial r_2^h(z)| &= |(\nabla r_2^h, \nabla g_z^h)| \\ &\leq ch^{-\alpha} \int_{\Omega} d^\alpha |\nabla^5 u_2| |\nabla g_z| dx + ch^{-r} \|g_z - g_z^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega \setminus D_1} \int_{\Omega} d^r |\nabla^5 u_2| dx \\ &\leq ch^{-\alpha} \|u_2\|_{5,\alpha+\beta-5} \|g_z\|_{1,-\beta-1,\Omega \setminus D_1} + ch^{\bar{\beta}-r-1-\epsilon} \|u_2\|_{5,r-4-\epsilon} \\ &\leq ch^{-\alpha} \|u_2\|_{5,\alpha+\beta-5} + ch^{\bar{\beta}-r-1-\epsilon} \|u_2\|_{5,r-4-\epsilon}. \end{aligned}$$

Provided  $\beta < \bar{\beta}$ ,  $\alpha + \beta - 5 > -\bar{\beta} - 1$  and  $r - 4 > -\bar{\beta} - 1$ , which yields

$$\|r_2^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq ch^{2\bar{\beta}-4-\epsilon} \quad \text{for } \epsilon > 0.$$

As to  $z_j^h$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned}
 |\partial z_j^h(z)| &= |(\nabla z_j^h, \nabla g_z^h)| \\
 &\leq ch^{-\alpha} \int_{\Gamma_j} d^\alpha |L_j^4 u_2 \partial_\tau g_z| ds + ch^{-r} \|g_z - g_z^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega \setminus D_1} \int_{\Gamma_j} d^r |L_j^4 u_2| ds \\
 &\leq ch^{-\alpha} \int_{\Omega} |\nabla(d^\alpha L_j^4 u_2 \partial_\tau g_z)| dx + ch^{\bar{\beta}-r-1-\epsilon} \int_{\Omega} |\nabla(d^r L_j^4 u_2)| dx \\
 &\leq ch^{-\alpha} \|u_2\|_{5,\alpha+\beta-5} \|g_z\|_{2,-\beta-1,\Omega \setminus D_1} + ch^{\bar{\beta}-r-1-\epsilon} \|u_2\|_{5,r-4-\epsilon} \\
 &\leq ch^{2\bar{\beta}-4-\epsilon}
 \end{aligned}$$

with the number  $\alpha, \bar{\beta}, r$  appropriately chosen.

Collecting all above relations, we obtain the error expansion

$$u^h - u^I = h^2 w^I + \tilde{r}^h$$

with some function  $w \in C^3(\Omega_0)$  and  $\tilde{r}^h$  satisfying

$$\|\tilde{r}^h\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq ch^{2\bar{\beta}-\epsilon}.$$

#### §4. Error Expansion on a Domain With Curved Boundary

Let  $\Omega$  be a bounded domain with a smooth boundary. For simplicity we assume that  $\Omega$  is convex. In order to keep the mesh varying regularly, we use a kind of piecewise almost uniform triangulation we are going to describe. In this section we give the outline of the proof of the error expansion at that case. For the details we refer the reader to [6]. Now let us introduce the triangulation. Devide  $\Omega$  into several parts  $\Omega_j$  by some straight line such that for each  $\Omega_j$  there is an invertible transformation  $\psi_j$  mapping  $\tilde{\Omega}_j$  onto the square  $[0, 1]^2$ , which, together with its inverse  $\phi_i = \psi_i^{-1}$ , is sufficiently smooth. In addition we assume that for each interior straight edge  $\Gamma$  of  $\Omega_i$  the restriction to  $\Gamma$  of  $\psi_i$  is affine. Let  $\tilde{T}^h$  be a uniform triangulation over  $[0, 1]^2$  with node set  $\tilde{N}^h$ , and let  $N_j^h = \psi_j(\tilde{N}^h)$ . Linking the points in  $N_j^h$  appropriatly, we obtain a triangulation  $T_j^h$  over  $\Omega_j$ . Then  $T^h = \cup T_j^h$  is a regular triangulation over  $\Omega$ . Such triangulation may be constructed directly (cf. [6]).

Now we analyze the properties of  $T^h$  through  $\tilde{T}^h$ . As in section 2, for any triangle  $\hat{K} \in \tilde{T}^h$ , we introduce the notation  $\hat{p}_d, \hat{s}_d, \hat{h}_d, \hat{n}_d, \hat{t}_d, \hat{T}_d$ . In addition we introduce the midpoint  $\hat{q}_d$  of  $\hat{s}_d$  and the center  $\hat{q}_0$  of  $\hat{K}$ . By  $h$  we denote the standard size of  $\tilde{T}^h : h = \max \hat{h}_d$ . Corresponding to  $\hat{K}$ , let  $K \in T_j^h$  be a triangular element with vertices

$$p = \psi_i(\hat{p}_d), \quad i \leq d \leq 3.$$



We denote the associate quantities by  $s_d, h_d, n_d, t_d, q_d, q_0, A$ . Define

$$\delta(K) = \hat{t}_d \cdot \hat{T}_d.$$

Then, for any two adjacent triangles  $K$  and  $K'$ , we have

$$\delta(K) = -\delta(K') \quad (4.1)$$

and the difference of the corresponding quantities between  $K$  and  $K'$  are of higher order:

$$h_d = h'_d + O(h^2), \quad t_d = -t'_d + O(h) \quad A = A' + O(h^3). \quad (4.2)$$

Using a Taylor expansion, it is easy to check that there exist smooth functions  $a_{d,i}, b_{d,i}$  defined on  $[0, 1]^2$  independent of  $h$  such that, for all  $K \in \mathcal{T}_i^h$ ,

$$(i) h_d = h a_{d,1}(\hat{q}_d) + h^3 a_{d,2}(\hat{q}_d) + O(h^4),$$

$$(ii) t_d = \delta(b_{d,1}(\hat{q}_d) + h^2 b_{d,2}(\hat{q}_d)) + O(h^3).$$

By the method used in [6] we can prove that there are some constants  $c_m$  and some piecewise smooth functions  $W$  and  $F_i$  such that

$$(\nabla(u^h - u^I), \nabla v) = h^2 \int_{\Omega} W v dx + h^2 \sum_i \int_{\Gamma_i} F_i v ds + h^2 \sum_m c_m v(M_m) + \widehat{R}_2(u, v)$$

where  $\{\Gamma_i\}_i$  denotes the set of all edges in  $\Omega$  of all  $\Omega_j$ ,  $\{M_m\}_m$  denotes the set of all interior corner points of  $\Omega_j$  and

$$|\widehat{R}_2(u, v)| \leq ch^4 (\|v\|_{1,1} + \sum_m |v(M_m)|).$$

As in section 2, we can derive that there exist some locally smooth function  $e$  and some function  $r_2 \in S^h$  such that

$$u^h - u^I = h^2 e^I + r_2, \quad \|r_2\|_{1,\infty,\Omega_0} \leq ch^4 |\ln h| \quad (4.8)$$

where  $\Omega_0$  is a domain bounded from  $\{M_m\}$ . A immediate application of (4.8) gives

$$(u^h - u)(p) = h^2 e(p) + O(h^4 |\ln h|)$$

for the nodal point  $p \in \Omega_0$ .

To discuss the derivatives, we have to deal with  $u^I$ . By the Taylor expansion, we write

$$\partial_1(u^I - u)(p_2) = \frac{1}{2} h_1 \partial_1^2 u(p_2) + \frac{1}{6} h_1^2 \partial_1^3 u(p_2) + \frac{1}{24} h_1^3 \partial_1^4 u(p_2) + O(h^4), \quad (4.9)$$

$$\partial_3(u^I - u)(p_2) = -\frac{1}{2} h_3 \partial_3^2 u(p_2) + \frac{1}{6} h_3^2 \partial_3^3 u(p_2) + \frac{1}{24} h_3^3 \partial_3^4 u(p_2) + O(h^4).$$

Representing the gradient  $\nabla$  by a linear combination of the directional derivatives  $\partial_3$ , and using (4.9) and Lemma 5, we can obtain the expansion

$$\nabla(u^I - u)(p_2) = h\delta \sum_{i=0}^2 h^i \delta^i B_i(P_2) + O(h^4) \quad (4.10)$$

where  $IB_i$  are some vector function defined on  $\Omega$ . For any node  $p$  in the interior of some  $\Omega_i$ , there are two opposite triangles  $K, K' \in T^h$  such that

$$p = p_2(K) = p_2(K').$$

We define

$$\bar{\nabla}v(p) = \frac{1}{2}(\nabla v|_K + \nabla v|_{K'}), \quad \text{for } v \in S^h.$$

Using (4.10), we have

$$\bar{\nabla}u^I(p) - \nabla u(p) = h^2 IB_1(p) + O(h^4). \quad (4.11)$$

Combining (4.8) with (4.11), we derive

$$\bar{\nabla}u^h(p) - \nabla u(p) = h^2(\nabla e + IB)(p) + O(h^4 |\ln h|)$$

for any nodal point  $p$  in  $\Omega_0 \setminus \cup \partial\Omega_j$ .

### References

- [1] M. Krizek, P. Neittamaki, On superconvergence Techniques, Preprint No. 34, Jyvaskyla University, Finland, 1984.
- [2] R. Rennacher, Extrapolation Techniques in the Finite Element Method (survey), Proceeding of the Summer School in Numerical Analysis at Helsinki 1987, Helsinki University of Technology. Institute of Mathematics, Report C 7, Feb. 1988, 80-113.
- [3] Q. Lin, R. Xie, Error Expansions for Finite Element Approximations and Their Applications, Lect. Notes in Math., 1297 (1987), 98-112.
- [4] L. B. Wahlbin, Local Behavior in Finite Element Methods, to Appear.
- [5] H. Blum, R. Rannacher, Extrapolation Techniques for Reducing the Pollution Effect of Reentrant Corners in the Finite Element Method, Preprint, Universitat Saarbrucken, 1987.
- [6] Q. Lin, R. Xie, How to recover the convergence rate for richardson extrapolation on bounded domains, *J. Comput. Math.*, 6 (1988), 68-79.
- [7] I. Babuska, A. Noor, Quality Assessment and Control of Finite Element Solution, Tech. Note BN-1049, IPST, University of Maryland, 1986.
- [8] P. Ciarlet, The Finite Element Method for Elliptic Problems, North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1978.
- [9] J. Whiteman, G. Goodsell, Superconvergent recovery for stresses..., Proc. Conf. MAFELAP VI, 1987, J. Whiteman (Ed.), Academic Press, London, 1988, 29-53.