

# $L^\infty$ CONVERGENCE OF CONFORMING FINITE ELEMENTS FOR THE BIHARMONIC EQUATION\*<sup>1)</sup>

Wang Ming

(Department of Mathematics, Peking University, Beijing, China)

## Abstract

The paper considers the  $L^\infty$  convergence for conforming finite elements, such as Argyris element, Bell element and Bogner-Fox-Schmit element, solving the boundary value problem of the biharmonic equation. The nearly optimal order  $L^\infty$  estimates are given.

## 1. Introduction

The author has considered the  $L^\infty$  error estimates of the nonconforming finite elements for the biharmonic equation (see [3]). This paper will discuss the case of conforming finite elements.

Let  $\Omega$  be a convex polygonal domain. The Dirichlet boundary value problem of the biharmonic equation is the following

$$\begin{cases} \Delta^2 u = f, & \text{in } \Omega \\ u|_{\partial\Omega} = \frac{\partial u}{\partial N}|_{\partial\Omega} = 0 \end{cases} \quad (1.1)$$

where  $N = (N_x, N_y)$  is the unit normal of  $\partial\Omega$ .

For  $p \in [1, \infty]$  and  $m \geq 0$ , let  $W^{m,p}(\Omega)$  and  $W_0^{m,p}(\Omega)$  be the usual Sobolev spaces, and  $\|\cdot\|_{m,p,\Omega}$  and  $|\cdot|_{m,p,\Omega}$  be the Sobolev norm and semi-norm respectively. When  $p = 2$ , denote them by  $H^m(\Omega)$ ,  $H_0^m(\Omega)$ ,  $\|\cdot\|_{m,\Omega}$  and  $|\cdot|_{m,\Omega}$  respectively. Let  $H^{-m}(\Omega)$  be the dual space of  $H_0^m(\Omega)$  with norm  $\|\cdot\|_{-m,\Omega}$ .

It is known that for  $\forall f \in H^{-1}(\Omega)$ , problem (1.1) has a unique solution  $u \in H_0^2(\Omega) \cap H^3(\Omega)$ , such that

$$\|u\|_{3,\Omega} \leq C \|f\|_{-1,\Omega}, \quad (1.2)$$

with  $C$  a positive constant.

Define, for  $\forall u, v \in H^2(\Omega)$ ,

$$a(u, v) = \int_{\Omega} \left( \frac{\partial^2 u}{\partial x^2} \frac{\partial^2 v}{\partial x^2} + 2 \frac{\partial^2 u}{\partial x \partial y} \frac{\partial^2 v}{\partial x \partial y} + \frac{\partial^2 u}{\partial y^2} \frac{\partial^2 v}{\partial y^2} \right) dx dy. \quad (1.3)$$

\* Received March 3, 1993.

<sup>1)</sup> The Project Supported by National Natural Science Foundation of China.

Let  $f \in L^2(\Omega)$ . The variational form of problem (1.1) is to find  $u \in H_0^2(\Omega)$ , such that

$$a(u, v) = (f, v), \quad \forall v \in H_0^2(\Omega), \tag{1.4}$$

where  $(\cdot, \cdot)$  is the  $L^2$  product.

For  $h \in (0, h_0)$  with  $h_0 \in (0, 1)$ , let  $\mathcal{T}_h$  be a subdivision of  $\Omega$  by triangles or rectangle. Let  $h_T = \text{diam } T$  and  $\rho_T$  the largest of the diameters of all circles contained in  $T$ . Assume that there exists a positive constant  $\eta$ , independent of  $h$ , such that  $\eta h < \rho_T < h_T \leq h$  for all  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ . Let  $V_h \subset H_0^2(\Omega)$  be a finite element space associated with  $\mathcal{T}_h$ .

The finite element approximation to problem (1.1) is to find  $u_h \in V_h$ , such that

$$a(u_h, v) = (f, v), \quad \forall v \in V_h. \tag{1.5}$$

This paper will show that the estimate of  $|u - u_h|_{1,\infty,\Omega}$  is  $\mathcal{O}(h^5 |\ln h|)$  for Argyris element,  $\mathcal{O}(h^4 |\ln h|)$  for Bell element and  $\mathcal{O}(h^3 |\ln h|)$  for Bogner-Fox-Schmit element.

The remaining of the paper is arranged as follows. Section 2 will give the  $L^\infty$  estimates for Argyris element and its properties. Section 3 will give the proof of the  $L^\infty$  estimate for Argyris element. The last section will consider the case of Bell element and Bogner-Fox-Schmit element.

## 2. Argyris Element

From now on, let  $\mathcal{T}_h$  be a subdivision of  $\Omega$  by triangles and  $V_h \subset H_0^2(\Omega)$  be Argyris finite element space associated with  $\mathcal{T}_h$ . Then  $V_h = \{v \mid v \in H_0^2(\Omega), v|_T \in P_5(T), \forall T \in \mathcal{T}_h\}$ . where  $P_m(T)$  is the set of all polynomials with degree not greater than  $m$  for nonnegative integer  $m$ . Denote  $Q_m(T)$  as the space consisting of all polynomials with degrees, with respect to  $x$  or  $y$ , not greater than  $m$ .

Let  $u$  be a solution of problem (1.1) and  $u_h$  that of problem (1.5). If  $u \in H_0^2(\Omega) \cap H^6(\Omega)$ , the following estimate is true:

$$\|u - u_h\|_{2,\Omega} \leq Ch^4 |u|_{6,\Omega}. \tag{2.1}$$

Throughout the paper,  $C$  always denotes the positive constant independent of  $h$ , with different values in different places. For  $L^\infty$  estimates, we have

**Theorem 1.** *Let  $V_h$  be Argyris finite element space,  $u$  the solution of problem (1.1) and  $u_h$  the solution of problem (1.5). Then*

$$|u - u_h|_{1,\infty,\Omega} \leq Ch^5 |\ln h| |u|_{6,\infty,\Omega} \tag{2.2}$$

when  $u \in W^{6,\infty}(\Omega)$ , and

$$|u - u_h|_{0,\infty,\Omega} \leq Ch^5 |\ln h|^{1/2} |u|_{6,\Omega} \tag{2.3}$$

when  $u \in H^6(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega)$ .

The proof of Theorem 1 will be given in Section 3. Now we list some properties of Argyris element space.

For  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ , let  $\Pi_T$  be the interpolation operator of Argyris element. For  $v \in H^6(\Omega)$ , let  $\Pi_h v|_T = \Pi_T v$  for all  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ . The following estimates are well known:

$$|v - \Pi_T v|_{m,T} \leq Ch^{6-m}|v|_{6,T}, \quad 0 \leq m \leq 6, v \in H^6(T), T \in \mathcal{T}_h. \tag{2.4}$$

From [2,4], the following inequalities are true for  $v \in V_h$ :

$$\sum_{i=0}^2 |v|_{i,\Omega} + |v|_{0,\infty,\Omega} \leq C|v|_{2,\Omega}, \tag{2.5}$$

$$|v|_{0,\infty,\Omega} \leq C|\ln h|^{1/2}|v|_{1,\Omega}, \tag{2.6}$$

$$|v|_{1,\infty,\Omega} \leq C|\ln h|^{1/2}|v|_{2,\Omega}. \tag{2.7}$$

Let  $P_h : L^2(\Omega) \rightarrow V_h$  be the  $L^2(\Omega)$  orthogonal projection operator, i.e., for  $\forall w \in L^2(\Omega)$ ,

$$(P_h w, v) = (w, v), \quad \forall v \in V_h. \tag{2.8}$$

The following is similar to Lemma 1 in [3]:

**Lemma 1.** *If  $0 \leq m \leq 2$ , then for  $w \in H_0^m(\Omega)$ ,*

$$|w - P_h w|_{0,\Omega} \leq Ch^m|w|_{m,\Omega}, \tag{2.9}$$

$$|P_h w|_{m,\Omega} \leq C|w|_{m,\Omega}. \tag{2.10}$$

Now we want to show that the error bound of  $u - u_h$  in norm  $\|\cdot\|_{1,\Omega}$  is one order higher than that in  $\|\cdot\|_{2,\Omega}$ . To do it, we need to construct an interpolation operator  $\tilde{\Pi}_h : H^3(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega) \rightarrow V_h$  with some interpolation properties.

For  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ , let  $P'_5(T) = \{ p|p \in P_5(T) \text{ and } \frac{\partial p}{\partial N} \in P_3(F) \text{ for each edge } F \text{ of } T \}$ . Let  $W_h$  be a finite element space associated with  $\mathcal{T}_h$ , which is determined as follows. For  $w \in W_h$ ,  $w|_T \in P_3(T)$  and  $w, \frac{\partial w}{\partial x}$  and  $\frac{\partial w}{\partial y}$  are continuous at the vertices of  $\mathcal{T}_h$  and vanish at the vertices along  $\partial\Omega$ .

For  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ , denote its vertices by  $A_T^1, A_T^2, A_T^3$  and its center point by  $A_T^0$ . For  $v \in H^3(T)$ , let  $\Pi_T^3 v$  be the interpolation polynomial of  $v$ , such that  $\Pi_T^3 v \in P_3(T)$  and  $\Pi_T^3 v$  equals  $v$  at  $A_T^i, 0 \leq i \leq 3$ , and  $\frac{\partial}{\partial x} \Pi_T^3 v, \frac{\partial}{\partial y} \Pi_T^3 v$  equal  $\frac{\partial v}{\partial x}, \frac{\partial v}{\partial y}$  at vertices  $A_T^1$  to  $A_T^3$  respectively. For  $v \in H^3(\Omega)$ , let  $\Pi_h^3 v$  be determined by  $\Pi_h^3 v|_T = \Pi_T^3(v|_T), \forall T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ .

For an arbitrary vertex  $A$ , let  $N_A$  be the number of elements containing point  $A$ . Obviously,  $N_A$  is bounded. For  $v \in H^3(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega)$ ,  $\tilde{\Pi}_h v \in V_h$  is determined as follows:

- 1) For each  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ ,  $\tilde{\Pi}_h v|_T \in P'_5(T)$ .
- 2)  $\tilde{\Pi}_h v, \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \tilde{\Pi}_h v$  and  $\frac{\partial}{\partial y} \tilde{\Pi}_h v$  equal  $v, \frac{\partial v}{\partial x}$  and  $\frac{\partial v}{\partial y}$  at the vertices respectively.
- 3) Let  $A$  be an arbitrary vertex. If  $A \in \Omega$ , then

$$\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A) = \frac{1}{N_A} \sum_{\substack{T \in \mathcal{T}_h \\ A \in T}} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_T^3 v(A). \quad i + j = 2. \tag{2.11}$$

If  $A$  is also a vertex of  $\Omega$ , then

$$\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A) = 0, \quad i + j = 2. \tag{2.12}$$

If  $A$  is on an edge of  $\partial\Omega$  and is not the vertex of  $\Omega$ , then

$$\begin{cases} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s^2} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A) = 0, \\ \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s \partial N} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A) = 0, \\ \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^2} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A) = \frac{1}{N_A} \sum_{\substack{T \in \mathcal{T}_h \\ A \in T}} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^2} \Pi_T^3 v(A), \end{cases} \tag{2.13}$$

where  $s$  is the tangent vector of  $\partial\Omega$ .

**Lemma 2.** *Let  $T_1$  and  $T_2$  be two triangles with common edge  $F$ , and let  $A_1$  and  $A_2$  be the endpoints of  $F$ . Then there exists a constant  $C$  independent of  $T_1$  and  $T_2$ , such that*

$$\sum_{k=1}^2 \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_1}^3 v(A_k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_2}^3 v(A_k) \right| \leq C |v|_{3, T_1 \cup T_2} \tag{2.14}$$

for all  $v \in H^3(T_1 \cup T_2)$ .

*Proof.* If  $p \in P_2(T_1 \cup T_2)$ , then  $\Pi_{T_1}^3(p|_{T_1}) = p|_{T_1}$ ,  $\Pi_{T_2}^3(p|_{T_2}) = p|_{T_2}$ . Hence

$$\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_1}^3 p(A_k) = \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_2}^3 p(A_k), \quad i + j = 2, \quad k = 1, 2.$$

By Bramble-Hilbert lemma and the affine technique, we get (2.14).

**Lemma 3.** *Let  $T$  be a triangle, and  $F$  be an edge of  $T$  with endpoints  $A_1$  and  $A_2$ . Denote the tangent vector of  $F$  by  $s$ . Then there exists a constant  $C$  independent of  $T$ , such that*

$$\sum_{k=1}^2 \left( \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s \partial x} \Pi_T^3 v(A_k) \right| + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s \partial y} \Pi_T^3 v(A_k) \right| \right) \leq C |v|_{3, T} \tag{2.15}$$

for all  $v \in H^3(T)$  with  $\frac{\partial v}{\partial x}(A_k) = 0, \frac{\partial v}{\partial y}(A_k) = 0$  for  $k = 1, 2$ .

*Proof.* From the definition of  $\Pi_T^3$ ,

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial x} \Pi_T^3 v(A_k) = 0, \quad \frac{\partial}{\partial y} \Pi_T^3 v(A_k) = 0, \quad k = 1, 2.$$

Hence, by the affine technique, we can get

$$\sum_{k=1}^2 \left( \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s \partial x} \Pi_T^3 v(A_k) \right| + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s \partial y} \Pi_T^3 v(A_k) \right| \right) \leq C |\Pi_T^3 v|_{3, T}.$$

(2.15) follows from  $|\Pi_T^3 v|_{3, T} \leq C |v|_{3, T}$ .

**Lemma 4.** *For  $\forall v \in H^3(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega)$ ,*

$$|v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{m, \Omega} \leq C h^{3-m} |v|_{3, \Omega}, \quad 0 \leq m \leq 2. \tag{2.16}$$

*Proof.* From the interpolation theory (see [1]), we have

$$|v - \Pi_h^3 v|_{m,\Omega} \leq Ch^{3-m}|v|_{3,\Omega}, \quad 0 \leq m \leq 2. \tag{2.17}$$

For each  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ , we can show that the following inequality:

$$\begin{aligned} \|p\|_{0,T}^2 &\leq Ch^2 \sum_{k=1}^3 [|p(A_T^k)|^2 + h^2 |\frac{\partial}{\partial x} p(A_T^k)|^2 + h^2 |\frac{\partial}{\partial y} p(A_T^k)|^2 \\ &\quad + h^4 \sum_{i+j=2} |\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} p(A_T^k)|^2] \end{aligned}$$

for all  $p \in P_5'(T)$ . Using  $\Pi_h^3 v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_T \in P_5'(T)$  and the definitions of  $\Pi_h^3$  and  $\tilde{\Pi}_h$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned} \|\Pi_h^3 v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v\|_{0,\Omega}^2 &= \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} \|\Pi_h^3 v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v\|_{0,T}^2 \\ &\leq Ch^6 \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} \sum_{k=1}^3 \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2. \end{aligned} \tag{2.18}$$

For  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$  and  $A_T^k$ , we consider three cases.

Firstly,  $A_T^k$  is in  $\Omega$ . Let  $T_1, \dots, T_l$  be all elements containing  $A_T^k$ , such that  $T_1 = T$ ,  $T_j \cap T_{j+1} (1 \leq j \leq l-1)$  is the common edge of  $T_j$  and  $T_{j+1}$ . From Lemma 2, we have

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \\ &\leq C \sum_{i+j=2} \sum_{n=1}^{l-1} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_n}^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_{n+1}}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \left(\frac{l-n}{l}\right)^2 \\ &\leq C \sum_{n=1}^l |v|_{3,T_n}^2. \end{aligned} \tag{2.19}$$

Secondly,  $A_T^k$  is also a vertex of  $\partial\Omega$ . Let the number  $l$  of elements containing  $A_T^k$  be greater than 1. There must be two different elements  $T'$  and  $T''$ , such that an edge  $F'$  of  $T'$  and an edge  $F''$  of  $T''$  are along  $\partial\Omega$  and  $A_T^k$  is an endpoint of both  $F'$  and  $F''$ . Let  $N', N''$  and  $s', s''$  be the unit normals and the unit tangents of  $F', F''$ , respectively. Let  $T_1, \dots, T_l$  be the elements containing  $A_T^k$  and  $T_1 = T, T_l = T'$  and  $T_j \cap T_{j+1} (1 \leq j \leq l-1)$  be a common edge of  $T_j$  and  $T_{j+1}$ . Then, from Lemma 2, we get

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2 = \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \\ &\leq C \sum_{i+j=2} \sum_{n=1}^{l-1} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_n}^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T_{n+1}}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
 &+ C \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T'}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \\
 &\leq C \left( \sum_{n=1}^l |v|_{3, T_n}^2 + \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T'}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \right). \tag{2.20}
 \end{aligned}$$

On the other hand, we have

$$\sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_{T'}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \leq C \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s''^i \partial s''^j} \Pi_{T'}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2,$$

where constant  $C$  is dependent on the angles at all vertices of  $\Omega$ . From Lemmas 2 and 3, we have

$$\begin{aligned}
 \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s''^i \partial s''^j} \Pi_{T'}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 &\leq C \left( |v|_{3, T'}^2 + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s''^2} \Pi_{T'}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \right) \\
 &\leq C \left( |v|_{3, T'}^2 + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s''^2} \Pi_{T''}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s''^2} \Pi_{T'}^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s''^2} \Pi_{T''}^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \right) \\
 &\leq C \sum_{\substack{\tilde{T} \in \mathcal{T}_h \\ A_T^k \in \tilde{T}}} |v|_{3, \tilde{T}}^2.
 \end{aligned}$$

Hence, from (2.20), we have

$$\sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \leq C \sum_{\substack{\tilde{T} \in \mathcal{T}_h \\ A_T^k \in \tilde{T}}} |v|_{3, \tilde{T}}^2. \tag{2.21}$$

If  $A_T^k$  is a vertex of  $\partial\Omega$  and only element  $T$  contains  $A_T^k$ , then the three vertices of  $T$  are all on  $\partial\Omega$ . Hence  $\Pi_h^3 v|_T \equiv 0$  and (2.21) is also true.

Thirdly,  $A_T^k$  is on an edge of  $\partial\Omega$  and is not the vertex of  $\Omega$ . Denote the unit normal of the edge by  $N$  and the unit tangent of the edge by  $s$ . From the definitions of  $\tilde{\Pi}_h v$ , we have

$$\begin{aligned}
 &\sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \\
 &\leq C \sum_{i+j=2} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^i \partial s^j} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^i \partial s^j} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \\
 &= C \left( \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s^2} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N \partial s} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \right. \\
 &\quad \left. + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^2} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^2} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \right).
 \end{aligned}$$

As in the second case, we can show that

$$\left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial s^2} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 + \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N \partial s} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \leq C \sum_{\substack{\tilde{T} \in \mathcal{T}_h \\ A_T^k \in \tilde{T}}} |v|_{3, \tilde{T}}^2,$$

and in the way for the first case, we can prove that

$$\left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^2} \Pi_h^3 v(A_T^k) - \frac{\partial^2}{\partial N^2} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A_T^k) \right|^2 \leq C \sum_{\substack{\tilde{T} \in \mathcal{T}_h \\ A_T^k \in \tilde{T}}} |v|_{3, \tilde{T}}^2$$

It follows that (2.21) is true for the third case as well.

Combining the discussion of three cases and (2.18), we get

$$|\Pi_h^3 v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{0, \Omega} \leq Ch^3 |v|_{3, \Omega}. \tag{2.22}$$

Lemma 4 follows from (2.17), (2.22) and the inverse inequality for polynomials.

From Lemma 4 and the Aubin-Nitsche technique, we can prove the following lemma.

**Lemma 5.** *Let  $u$  be the solution of (1.1) and  $u_h$  the solution of (1.5) with  $V_h$  the Argyris element space. Then*

$$\|u - u_h\|_{m, \Omega} \leq Ch^{3-m} |u|_{3, \Omega}, \quad m = 1, 2 \tag{2.23}$$

when  $f \in H^{-1}(\Omega)$ , and

$$\|u - u_h\|_{1, \Omega} \leq Ch^5 |u|_{6, \Omega} \tag{2.24}$$

when  $u \in H^6(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega)$ .

### 3. The proof of Theorem 1

In this section, we will prove Theorem 1. Firstly, let the solution  $u$  of (1.1) be in  $H^6(\Omega)$ . From (2.6), Lemma 5 and the interpolation theory, we have

$$\begin{aligned} \|u - u_h\|_{0, \infty, \Omega} &\leq \|u - \Pi_h u\|_{0, \infty, \Omega} + \|\Pi_h u - u_h\|_{0, \infty, \Omega} \\ &\leq C \left( h^5 |v|_{6, \Omega} + |\ln h|^{1/2} |\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1, \Omega} \right) \\ &\leq Ch^5 |\ln h|^{1/2} |u|_{6, \Omega}, \end{aligned}$$

i.e., (2.3) is true. What remains is to prove (2.2). Assume  $u \in W^{6, \infty}(\Omega)$ . By the interpolation result (see [1]), we have

$$\begin{aligned} |u - u_h|_{1, \infty, \Omega} &\leq |u - \Pi_h u|_{1, \infty, \Omega} + |\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1, \infty, \Omega} \\ &\leq Ch^5 |u|_{6, \infty, \Omega} + |\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1, \infty, \Omega}. \end{aligned} \tag{3.1}$$

So we must estimate  $|\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1, \infty, \Omega}$ . Let  $T' \in \mathcal{T}_h$  be the element such that  $|\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1, \infty, \Omega} = |\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1, \infty, T'}$ . Without losing generality, suppose that

$$|\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1, \infty, T'} = \left| \frac{\partial(\Pi_h u - u_h)}{\partial x} \right|_{0, \infty, T'}$$

Let  $(x_0, y_0) \in T'$  be the point such that

$$\left| \frac{\partial(\Pi_h u - u_h)}{\partial x} \right|_{0, \infty, T'} = \left| \frac{\partial(\Pi_h u - u_h)}{\partial x} (x_0, y_0) \right|$$

To prove (2.2), we need some results about the weight function and the regular Green function. For  $(x_0, y_0)$ , define the weight function  $\rho$  as

$$\rho(x, y) = (x - x_0)^2 + (y - y_0)^2 + \lambda^2 h^2,$$

with  $\lambda$  a fixed positive number. For integer  $\alpha$  and a bounded domain  $G \in R^2$ , define

$$|v|_{m,(\alpha),G} = \left( \sum_{i+j=m} \int_G \rho^{-\alpha} \left| \frac{\partial^m v}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} \right|^2 dx dy \right)^{1/2} \tag{3.2}$$

when  $v \in H^m(G)$ . When  $G = \Omega$ ,  $|\cdot|_{m,(\alpha),G}$  is replaced by  $|\cdot|_{m,(\alpha)}$ . For the weight function, the following inequalities are true:

$$|v|_{m,(\gamma)} \leq (\lambda h)^{-(\gamma-\alpha)} |v|_{m,(\alpha)}, \quad \gamma > \alpha, v \in H^m(\Omega), \tag{3.3}$$

$$|v|_{0,(1)} \leq C |\ln h|^{1/2} \|v\|_{0,\infty,\Omega}, \quad \forall v \in L^\infty(\Omega), \tag{3.4}$$

$$\left| \int_\Omega v w dx dy \right| \leq |v|_{0,(\alpha)} |w|_{0,(-\alpha)}, \quad v, w \in L^2(\Omega), \tag{3.5}$$

$$|v - \Pi_T v|_{k,(\alpha),T} \leq C h^{6-k} |v|_{6,(\alpha),T}, \quad 0 \leq k \leq 6, v \in H^6(T), T \in \mathcal{T}_h. \tag{3.6}$$

**Lemma 6.** *There exists a constant  $C$  such that, for  $v \in H_0^2(\Omega) \cap H^3(\Omega)$ , the following inequalities are true:*

$$|v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{m,(\alpha)} \leq C h^{3-m} |v|_{3,(\alpha)}, \quad 0 \leq m \leq 2. \tag{3.7}$$

*Proof.* Let  $0 \leq m \leq 2$ . Then

$$|v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{m,(\alpha)}^2 = \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} |v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{m,(\alpha),T}^2 \leq \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} \|\rho^{-\alpha}\|_{0,\infty,T} |v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{m,T}^2. \tag{3.8}$$

For  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ , let  $S_h(T) = \{\tilde{T} \in \mathcal{T}_h; T \cap \tilde{T} \neq \emptyset\}$ . From the proof of Lemma 4, we see

$$|v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{m,T}^2 \leq C h^{2(3-m)} \sum_{\tilde{T} \in S_h(T)} |v|_{3,\tilde{T}}^2. \tag{3.9}$$

For  $\forall T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ , we have

$$\max_{\substack{\tilde{T} \in S_h(T) \\ (x,y) \in \tilde{T}}} \rho(x, y) \leq C \min_{\substack{\tilde{T} \in S_h(T) \\ (x,y) \in \tilde{T}}} \rho(x, y).$$

Then from (3.8) and (3.9), we get

$$|v - \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_{m,(\alpha)}^2 \leq C h^{2(3-m)} \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} \sum_{\tilde{T} \in S_h(T)} |v|_{3,\tilde{T}}^2.$$

Because the number of the elements in  $S_h(T)$  is bounded, Lemma 6 is proved.

Now we turn to the regular Green function. Let  $q \in P_5(T')$  satisfy

$$\int_{T'} q p dx dy = \frac{\partial}{\partial x} p(x_0, y_0), \quad \forall p \in P_5(T').$$



Define  $\delta_h \in L^2(\Omega)$  such that

$$\delta_h(x, y) = \begin{cases} q(x, y), & (x, y) \in T', \\ 0, & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases} \tag{3.10}$$

Let  $g$  be the regular Green function determined by

$$\begin{cases} \Delta^2 g = \delta_h, & \text{in } \Omega, \\ g|_{\partial\Omega} = \frac{\partial g}{\partial N}|_{\partial\Omega} = 0 \end{cases} \tag{3.11}$$

and  $g_h$  be its finite element solution by Argyris element, i.e.,

$$a(g_h, v_h) = (\delta_h, v_h), \quad \forall v_h \in V_h. \tag{3.12}$$

For  $\delta_h, g$  and  $g_h$ , we have the following estimates:

$$\|\delta_h\|_{0,\Omega} \leq Ch^{-2}, \tag{3.13}$$

$$\|\delta_h\|_{-1,\Omega} \leq Ch^{-1}, \tag{3.14}$$

$$\|g - g_h\|_{1,\Omega} + h|g - g_h|_{2,\Omega} + h^2|g|_{3,\Omega} \leq Ch, \tag{3.15}$$

$$\|g\|_{2,\Omega} \leq C|\ln h|^{1/2}, \tag{3.16}$$

$$|g|_{3,(-1)} \leq C|\ln h|^{1/2}, \tag{3.17}$$

which are similar to those in [3].

**Lemma 7.**

$$|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)} \leq Ch|\ln h|^{1/2}. \tag{3.18}$$

*Proof.* By simple computation, we have

$$\begin{aligned} |g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}^2 &\leq \int_{\Omega} \rho \left[ \left( \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^2} (g - g_h) \right)^2 + 2 \left( \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x \partial y} (g - g_h) \right)^2 + \left( \frac{\partial^2}{\partial y^2} (g - g_h) \right)^2 \right] dx dy \\ &\leq |a(g - g_h, \rho(g - g_h))| + \left| \left( \frac{\partial^2 (g - g_h)}{\partial x^2}, g - g_h \right) \right| + \left| \left( \frac{\partial^2 (g - g_h)}{\partial y^2}, g - g_h \right) \right| \\ &\quad + C \sum_{i+j=2} \int_{\Omega} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} (g - g_h) \right| \rho^{1/2} \left| \frac{\partial (g - g_h)}{\partial x} \right| dx dy \\ &\quad + C \sum_{i+j=2} \int_{\Omega} \left| \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x^i \partial y^j} (g - g_h) \right| \rho^{1/2} \left| \frac{\partial (g - g_h)}{\partial y} \right| dx dy. \end{aligned}$$

From (3.5) and Green formula, we get

$$\begin{aligned} |g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}^2 &\leq |a(g - g_h, \rho(g - g_h))| + C|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}|g - g_h|_{1,\Omega} \\ &\quad + \left| \left( \frac{\partial^2 (g - g_h)}{\partial x^2}, g - g_h \right) \right| + \left| \left( \frac{\partial^2 (g - g_h)}{\partial y^2}, g - g_h \right) \right| \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} &\leq |a(g - g_h, \rho(g - g_h))| + C|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}|g - g_h|_{1,\Omega} \\ &\quad + \left| \frac{\partial}{\partial x}(g - g_h) \right|_{0,\Omega}^2 + \left| \frac{\partial}{\partial y}(g - g_h) \right|_{0,\Omega}^2. \end{aligned}$$

By (3.15), we have

$$|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}^2 \leq |a(g - g_h, \rho(g - g_h))| + Ch|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)} + Ch^2. \tag{3.19}$$

From (3.3), (3.5) and (3.7), we have

$$\begin{aligned} |a(g - g_h, \rho(g - \tilde{\Pi}_h g))| &\leq C|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}|\rho(g - \tilde{\Pi}_h g)|_{2,(1)} \\ &\leq C|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}(|g - \tilde{\Pi}_h g|_{2,(-1)} + |g - \tilde{\Pi}_h g|_{1,(0)} + |g - \tilde{\Pi}_h g|_{0,(1)}) \\ &\leq Ch|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}(|g|_{3,(-1)} + h|g|_{3,\Omega} + h^2|g|_{3,(1)}) \\ &\leq Ch|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}(|g|_{3,(-1)} + h|g|_{3,\Omega}). \end{aligned}$$

From (3.17), we get

$$|a(g - g_h, \rho(g - \tilde{\Pi}_h g))| \leq Ch|\ln h|^{1/2}|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}. \tag{3.20}$$

For  $v \in L^2(T)$ , let  $P_T^0 v \in L^2(T)$  be the orthogonal projection of  $v$  in  $P_0(T)$ . From (1.4), (1.5), (3.5) and (3.6), we have

$$\begin{aligned} |a(g - g_h, \rho(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h))| &= |a(g - g_h, \rho(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h) - \Pi_h(\rho(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h)))| \\ &\leq C|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)} \left( \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} \left| \rho(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h) - \Pi_h(\rho(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h)) \right|_{2,(1),T}^2 \right)^{1/2} \\ &= C|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)} \left( \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} |(\rho - P_T^0 \rho)(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h) - \Pi_h(\rho - P_T^0 \rho)(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h)|_{2,(1),T}^2 \right)^{1/2} \\ &\leq Ch^4 |g - g_h|_{2,(-1)} \left( \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} |(\rho - P_T^0 \rho)(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h)|_{6,(1),T}^2 \right)^{1/2}. \end{aligned}$$

On the other hand,

$$\begin{aligned} \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} |(\rho - P_T^0 \rho)(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h)|_{6,(1),T}^2 &\leq C \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} \left( h^2 |\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h|_{6,T}^2 \right. \\ &\quad \left. + |\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h|_{5,T}^2 + |\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h|_{4,(1),T}^2 \right) \leq Ch^{-6} \sum_{T \in \mathcal{T}_h} |\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h|_{2,T}^2 \\ &= Ch^{-6} |\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h|_{2,\Omega}^2 \leq Ch^{-6} \end{aligned}$$

by (2.16), (3.3), (3.15), the inverse inequality, and the inequality

$$\left| \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial x} \right|^2 + \left| \frac{\partial \rho}{\partial y} \right|^2 \leq C\rho.$$

Hence

$$|a(g - g_h, \rho(\tilde{\Pi}_h g - g_h))| \leq Ch|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}. \tag{3.21}$$

Combining (3.19) to (3.21), we get

$$|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)}^2 \leq Ch |\ln h|^{1/2} (|g - g_h|_{2,(-1)} + h).$$

Inequality (3.18) follows.

From (1.4), (1.5), (3.5) and (3.10) and (3.12), we have

$$\begin{aligned} |\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1,\infty,\Omega} &= |(\delta_h, \Pi_h u - u_h)| = |a(g_h, \Pi_h u - u_h)| \\ &= |a(g - g_h, u - \Pi_h u) + (\Delta^2 g, \Pi_h u - u)| \\ &\leq C \left( |g - g_h|_{2,(-1)} |u - \Pi_h u|_{2,(1)} + |\delta_h|_{0,(-1)} |u - \Pi_h u|_{0,(1)} \right). \end{aligned}$$

By (3.4), (3.6), (3.10) and (3.18), we get

$$|\Pi_h u - u_h|_{1,\infty,\Omega} \leq Ch^5 |\ln h|^{1/2} |u|_{6,(1)} \leq Ch^5 |\ln h| |u|_{6,\infty,\Omega}. \tag{3.22}$$

Inequalities (3.1) and (3.22) imply (2.2). Theorem 1 is proved.

#### 4. Bell Element and Bogner-Fox-Schmit Element

First, let  $\mathcal{T}_h$  be a subdivision of  $\Omega$  by triangles and  $V_h \subset H_0^2(\Omega)$  be Bell finite element space associated with  $\mathcal{T}_h$ . Then  $V_h = \{v \mid v \in H_0^2(\Omega), v|_T \in P_5'(T), \forall T \in \mathcal{T}_h\}$ .

Similarly to the analysis for Argyris element, we can prove the following.

**Theorem 2.** *Let  $V_h$  be Bell finite element space,  $u$  the solution of problem (1.1) and  $u_h$  the solution of problem (1.5). Then*

$$|u - u_h|_{1,\infty,\Omega} \leq Ch^4 |\ln h| |u|_{5,\infty,\Omega} \tag{4.1}$$

when  $u \in W^{5,\infty}(\Omega)$ , and

$$|u - u_h|_{0,\infty,\Omega} \leq Ch^4 |\ln h|^{1/2} |u|_{5,\Omega} \tag{4.2}$$

when  $u \in H^5(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega)$ .

From now on, let  $\Omega$  be a rectangle with its edges parallel to  $x$  or  $y$  axis respectively. Let  $\mathcal{T}_h$  be a subdivision of  $\Omega$  by rectangles with their edges parallel to  $x$  or  $y$  axis, and  $V_h \subset H_0^2(\Omega)$  be Bogner-Fox-Schmit finite element space associated with  $\mathcal{T}_h$ . Then  $v \in V_h$  if and only if the following are true:

1)  $v|_T$  is in  $Q_3(T)$  for all  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ .

2)  $v, \frac{\partial}{\partial x}v, \frac{\partial}{\partial y}v$  and  $\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x \partial y}v$  are continuous at the vertices and vanish at the vertices along  $\partial\Omega$ .

For this element, we have

**Theorem 3.** *Let  $V_h$  be Bogner-Fox-Schmit finite element space,  $u$  the solution of problem (1.1) and  $u_h$  the solution of problem (1.5). Then*

$$|u - u_h|_{1,\infty,\Omega} \leq Ch^3 |\ln h| |u|_{4,\infty,\Omega} \tag{4.3}$$

when  $u \in W^{4,\infty}(\Omega)$ , and

$$|u - u_h|_{0,\infty,\Omega} \leq Ch^3 |\ln h|^{1/2} |u|_{4,\Omega} \tag{4.4}$$

when  $u \in H^4(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega)$ .

The proof of Theorem 3 is similar to that of Theorem 1. The orders of  $h$  and the Sobolev norms should be changed relevantly, and the operator  $\tilde{\Pi}_h$  should be replaced by the following.

For  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ , denote its vertices by  $A_T^1, A_T^2, A_T^3, A_T^4$ . For  $v \in H^3(T)$ , let  $P_T^a v$  be the interpolation polynomial of  $v$  by Adini element, i.e.,  $P_T^a v \in P_3(T) + \text{spann} \{x^3y, xy^3\}$ , and let  $\Pi_T^a v, \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \Pi_T^a v$  and  $\frac{\partial}{\partial y} \Pi_T^a v$  equal  $v, \frac{\partial v}{\partial x}$  and  $\frac{\partial v}{\partial y}$  at vertices  $A_T^1$  to  $A_T^4$  respectively. For  $v \in H^3(\Omega)$ , let  $\Pi_h^a v$  be determined by  $\Pi_h^a v|_T = \Pi_T^a(v|_T), \forall T \in \mathcal{T}_h$ .

For an arbitrary vertex  $A$ , let  $N_A$  be the number of elements containing point  $A$ . Obviously,  $N_A$  is bounded. For  $v \in H^3(\Omega) \cap H_0^2(\Omega)$ ,  $\tilde{\Pi}_h v \in V_h$  is determined by the following:

- i) For each  $T \in \mathcal{T}_h, \tilde{\Pi}_h v|_T \in Q_3(T)$ .
- 2)  $\tilde{\Pi}_h v, \frac{\partial}{\partial x} \tilde{\Pi}_h v$  and  $\frac{\partial}{\partial y} \tilde{\Pi}_h v$  equal  $v, \frac{\partial v}{\partial x}$  and  $\frac{\partial v}{\partial y}$  at the vertices respectively.
- 3) Let  $A$  be an arbitrary vertex. If  $A \in \Omega$ , then

$$\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x \partial y} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A) = \frac{1}{N_A} \sum_{\substack{T \in \mathcal{T}_h \\ A \in T}} \frac{\partial^2}{\partial x \partial y} \Pi_T^a v(A). \tag{4.5}$$

If  $A$  is on  $\partial\Omega$ , then

$$\frac{\partial^2}{\partial x \partial y} \tilde{\Pi}_h v(A) = 0. \tag{4.6}$$

For the operator  $\tilde{\Pi}_h$  defined this way, Lemmas 4 and 6 are also true.

### References

- [1] P.G. Ciarlet, Finite Element Method for Elliptic Problems, North-Holland, Amsterdam, New York, Oxford, 1978.
- [2] Wang Ming, On the inequalities for the maximum norm of nonconforming finite element spaces, *Mathematica Numerica Sinica*, **12** : 1 (1990). (in Chinese)
- [3] Wang Ming,  $L^\infty$  error estimates of nonconforming finite elements for the biharmonic equation, Research report, No. 11, 1992, Institute of Mathematics and Department of Mathematics, Peking University.
- [4] Zhang Hong-qing and Wang Ming, The Mathematical Theory of Finite Element Methods, Science Press, Beijing, 1991. (in Chinese)